

## **PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORIC CONSERVATION BOARD**

**MONDAY, OCTOBER 23, 2006**

**3:00 P.M., J. MARTIN GRIESEL ROOM, CENTENNIAL PLAZA II**

The Historic Conservation Board met at 3:19 P.M., in the J. Martin Griesel Room, Centennial Plaza II, with members Senhauser, Chatterjee, Raser, Spraul-Schmidt and Sullebarger present. Kreider, Bloomfield and Wallace absent.

### **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, DD REVIEW & ZONING VARIANCES, NEW K-12 SCHOOL FOR THE CREATIVE & PERFORMING ARTS (SCPA), OVER-THE-RHINE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Staff member Adrienne Cowden presented a report on a proposed new K-12 Performing Arts School on the block bounded by Central Parkway, 12<sup>th</sup>, Race and Elm Streets. The project site is located in the Over-the-Rhine Historic District and is within the Downtown Development (DD) Zoning District. Construction is scheduled to begin in 2007 and be completed in time for the 2009-2010 school year.

The Board last reviewed this project on July 31, 2006. At that time the Board approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of 1127 Race Street. It tabled the remainder of the proposal and formed a sub-committee (Mr. Senhauser, Mr. Chatterjee, and Ms. Spraul-Schmidt) to continue discussions with Cincinnati Public Schools (CPS) and the design team.

The subcommittee met with CPS and the design team several times over the past few months and arrived at a revised design it could support. Ms. Cowden outlined the changes Cole Russell + Fanning Howey + Moody Nolan made in response to the subcommittee's comments. Additional landscaping, a metal picket fence on a brick base and the relocation of the parking lot entrance to Race Street define a more "urban" edge along 12<sup>th</sup> Street. In anticipation of the acquisition and demolition of the Drop Inn Center transitional housing, an outdoor performance area was added at the southeast corner of 12<sup>th</sup> and Elm Streets. The fencing and revised positioning of statuary help to better define the school's Washington Park entrance and facade.

Ms. Cowden reviewed the conditions in the historic guidelines for demolition of the contributing buildings at 1121 and 1129-1131 Race Street and stated that staff felt the SCPA request met the conditions. She also outlined the Zoning Variances needed for the project.

Curtis Moody, Moody Nolan, summarized the development of the SCPA design and changes that were made based on meetings with the Board subcommittee. Mr. Moody indicated the design team had looked to the neighborhood for ideas. He felt the design team had been responsive to resident concerns but acknowledged that some suggestions, although thoughtfully considered could not be accommodated.

In response to Mr. Raser, Mr. Moody stated that the siting of the building was dictated by a combination of private donor preference, the programmatic needs of the school (including on site parking) and state requirements.

A variety of interested parties spoke in support of the project. Thomas Klinedinst Chairman of the GCAEC, stated that this project was a precedent setting partnership of Cincinnati Public Schools and the public and would draw national attention to Over-the-Rhine and the city. John Carlisle, Principal of SCPA, encouraged the Board to approve the project. Brad Gerard, SCPA

teacher, said he felt the design team created a school that is a work of art and that will meet the daily needs of students and teachers. Brian Siekmann, SCPA orchestra director, stated he felt the building was well designed and would work well for teachers and students. Dr. Isidore Rudnick, SCPA artistic director, stated the new school would attract new students and bring families downtown. He said he has already received calls from the parents of prospective students specifically as a result of the proposed new facility.

Ken Jones, architect and Over-the-Rhine resident, said that he looks forward to the project and hopes that it will benefit the City and the Over-the-Rhine community. Nonetheless he felt it important to reiterate his concerns regarding the on-site parking and the transition between the school and Washington Park.

Mr. Moody indicated that the new school would reawaken the neighborhood and provide activities both during the day and in the evening. He stated that the new design treatments enhanced the school design and thanked the Board subcommittee for its assistance.

In response to Ms. Sullebarger, Tom Lindsey of the design team stated that the on-site parking was only 10% of the total parking needed for staff, students and visitors and has been reduced from the original proposal.

Mr. Senhauser stated that the guidelines did not give the Board the authority to require a change in the siting of the building. The subcommittee expressed concern about vehicular access into the parking lot, the definition of exterior spaces and an urban edge and the relationship between SCPA and Washington Park. He said that the subcommittee believed the SCPA design team had attempted to address these issues.

Mr. Raser thanked the subcommittee for its work with the SCPA. He stated that the Zoning Code calls for maximum set-backs and is not arbitrary and that he could find no justification for the on-site parking. He added that suggestions from the Board given early in the design process should have been incorporated into the site plan. He stated he felt the design fell short and that he could not support the proposal.

### **BOARD ACTION**

The Board voted 4 to 1 (Senhauser, Chatterjee, Spraul-Schmidt and Sullebarger aye; Raser, nay), (motion by Chatterjee, second Spraul-Schmidt) to take the following actions:

1. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of 1121 Race Street and 1129-1131 Race Street finding that Cincinnati Public Schools, a non-profit organization, cannot reuse the buildings in a manner compatible with its organizational purposes with the following condition:
  - a. An Ohio Historic Inventory form with interior and exterior photographs shall be prepared for 1121 Race Street and 1131 Race Street and submitted to the Historic Conservation Office prior to demolition.
2. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed school finding that the design meets the Over-the-Rhine Historic District Conservation Guidelines for new construction with the following condition:
  - a. Final construction drawings shall be submitted to the Urban Conservator and the Chairman of the Historic Conservation Board for review and approval prior to construction.

3. Approve the necessary Zoning Variances to permit (as specifically outlined in the staff report and attached documents):
  - a. To allow a variance from a greater than zero setback for the building,
  - b. Only two loading spaces,
  - c. More than 25% of the required parking to be located off-site
  - d. Accessory off-site parking spaces to be located outside of the required 200 foot radius,
  - e. A L.E.D. marquis sign on Central Parkway,
  - f. An 11'-0" tall wall sign to be etched into the theater lobby glass,
  - g. The proposed signage on the Central Parkway elevation, the display area of which exceeds the building frontage on this right-of-way and
  - h. A fence that exceeds 6'-0" in height.

Finding that relief from the literal interpretation of the Zoning Code will not be materially detrimental to the public health, safety and welfare or injurious to property in the district or vicinity where the property is located and is necessary and appropriate in the interest of historic conservation as not to adversely affect the historic architectural or aesthetic integrity of the district.

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 1201-1215 VINE STREET, OVER-THE-RHINE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Staff member Adrienne Cowden presented a staff report for the rehabilitation of 1201, 1203, 1207-1209, 1211 and 1213-1215 Vine Street for residential condominiums and commercial uses.

The six buildings will be combined to create 26 residential condominiums. The first floor commercial spaces will be white-boxed and finished when an appropriate tenant is identified. A new elevator tower will be installed at the rear of 1205 Vine to serve all six buildings. A lobby and courtyard at the rear of 1203 Vine will provide access to the elevator. The exterior masonry walls will be cleaned and tuckpointed as necessary and then painted. Chimneys and roofs will be repaired as necessary. New windows and storefronts will be installed. Original cast iron storefront frames will be cleaned, repaired as necessary and painted.

In response to Ms. Sullebarger, Ms. Cowden stated she discovered the project was in progress when she conducted a site visit on October 18, 2006. Ms. Cowden stated that the one-story rear wing of 1203 Vine Street had been demolished. Roofing, masonry repointing / repair and painting were in progress. A number of window sashes had been removed.

Rick Kimbler and Brandon Smith, the developers, were present at the meeting. Mr. Kimbler stated that the project was financially challenging and due to funding requirements must be completed by June 2007. Mr. Kimbler acknowledged that work had started in May without permits or a Certificate of Appropriateness, due to the deadline and financial constraints. He stated that because of cost, maintenance and market preference he would like to replace missing or damaged windows with aluminum. Storefronts that were not original or that cannot be repaired would be replaced with new bronze aluminum. Openings would not be changed and the brick molding would be retained. In response to Mr. Chatterjee, Ms. Cowden stated the proposed aluminum replacements would meet the guidelines provided they fit the openings and had the appearance of the original sash.

Mr. Senhauser stated that it was difficult to evaluate a project when so much work had already been completed. Regardless of the June 2007 deadline, proper procedure should have been followed. Ms. Sullebarger agreed that a projected timeline/deadline was not valid justification for undertaking work prior to applying for and receiving permits and a Certificate of Appropriateness.

In response to Mr. Raser's questions, Mr. Smith stated that the 12<sup>th</sup> Street doors to the residential units were not original and would be replaced with four-paneled aluminum doors.

Mr. Raser suggested that an aluminum storefront with the appearance of the existing historic wood storefront would be acceptable. He suggested adding a horizontal aluminum kick-plate or bar to the bottom of the glass commercial doors. Ms. Sullebarger recommended repainting the brick around the entrance on 12<sup>th</sup> Street.

### **BOARD ACTION**

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Sullebarger, second Chatterjee) to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:

1. Approve the demolition of the one-story rear wing at 1203 Vine Street finding that it comprises a non-significant portion of the building.
2. The historic storefronts, cast iron framework, and wood doors at 1201 Vine Street shall be repaired or replaced with an aluminum storefront system to replication the configuration of the original as closely as possible.
3. The original wood sash on the Vine and 12<sup>th</sup> Street elevations at 1201 and 1203 Vine Street should be repaired and retained if possible. If not, the sash shall be replaced with a new window that matches the original in configuration, material and overall appearance.
4. The exterior masonry walls of 1211 and 1213-1215 Vine Street shall not be painted.
5. Final plans and specifications shall be submitted to the Urban Conservator for review and approval prior to construction.

### **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 1214-1220 VINE STREET, OVER-THE-RHINE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Staff member Adrienne Cowden summarized the staff report for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the rehabilitation of 1214 and 1220 Vine Street for residential condominiums and future commercial uses on the first floor.

In response to Ms. Sullebarger Ms. Cowden indicated that she was comfortable with the report recommendations but indicated the applicant might wish to request revisions. Mark Gunther, Wichman Gunther Architects, Inc., stated he had no issues with the staff report or recommendations. However, he did wish to install aluminum windows in the main (west) façade of 1220 Vine Street instead of the wood windows specified in the submitted plans.

Ms. Warminski, Cincinnati Preservation Association, stated she was happy to see the buildings rehabilitated and supported staff recommendations.

### **BOARD ACTION**

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Sullebarger, second Chatterjee) to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:

1. The proposed Vine Street elevation balconies shall be recessed behind the stone storefront of the main (west) façade of 1220 Vine Street.
2. The new bronze anodized aluminum storefronts for the main (west) façade of 1220 Vine Street shall have glazed doors.
3. The cornice windows at the new deck locations at 1220 Vine Street should be painted out or backfilled behind the sash.
4. Final plans and specifications shall be submitted to the Urban Conservator for review and approval prior to construction.

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS & ZONING VARIANCES, 2963 ANNWOOD AVENUE, EAST WALNUT HILLS HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Staff member Caroline Kellam presented a report for a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness and Zoning Variances to install fencing, gates, a terrace and landscaping at 2963 Annwood Avenue in the East Walnut Hills Historic District.

Ms. Kellam stated that the property has semi-circular driveway in the front yard, which provides the only on-site parking. The driveway is screened by an existing brick wall that runs the width of the site on the front property line; a lower brick wall runs along the north property line. The rear property line has a wood lattice fence; a wood privacy fence capped by lattice runs along the north side of the rear yard. There is no fence along the south property line.

The Reiningers wish to fence in the entirety of the property to create a secure environment for children and dogs. A new aluminum picket fence will be installed along the south and a portion of the north property line. New gates/fencing will be installed at the entrances to the circular driveway. The proposal also includes the removal of an existing non-contributing shed and concrete patio and the installation of a new stone terrace, an arbor, landscaping and a pizza oven in the rear yard.

Mr. Forwood confirmed for Ms. Sullebarger that the present brick wall varies in height from 4 ½ feet on the north to 6 ½ feet on the south. Except along the north property line where the fence will be built atop the brick retaining wall, the fence will not exceed the height of the existing wall. Ms. Sullebarger stated that since there was already a wall and fence in the front yard, it would be acceptable to approve the request for gates, but that they and the new fence on the south side should not exceed the height of the existing brick wall.

David Reininger explained that his main reason for requesting the fencing was safety. His property had been broken into several times, and he expressed his desire to create a secure environment for his family. He also indicated that the Cincinnati Preservation Association, which has an easement on the property, had reviewed and approved the fence. CPA stipulated that the gates should be level rather than the arched as proposed.

Pam Domittner, owner and resident of 2999 Annwood Avenue, stated she had looked at the plans and felt the new fence would not be detrimental to the neighborhood.

Yvonne Schrotel, owner and resident of 2959 Annwood Avenue, expressed her concern for the visual loss of her side yard and the affect on her driveway entrance. She stated that the Reiningers have worked with her to address her concerns and agreed to move the proposed fence location to preserve two large trees. The Board observed that the irregular south property line

was atypical, but the fence could be installed in a straighter path. The parties agreed to discuss the issue further.

### **BOARD ACTION**

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Sullebarger, second Chatterjee) to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:

1. Approve a Zoning Variance for the proposed fencing finding that it is in the interest of historic conservation to grant the variance on the condition that the height of the fence on south property line and the gates not exceed 6 feet or the height of the existing brick wall. Finding that relief from the literal interpretation of the Zoning Code will not be materially detrimental to the public health, safety and welfare or injurious to property in the district or vicinity where the property is located and is necessary and appropriate in the interest of historic conservation as not to adversely affect the historic architectural or aesthetic integrity of the district.
2. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of new fencing, gates, stone patio, arbor and pizza oven at 2923 Annwood Avenue with the following conditions:
  - a. Greater than zero setbacks for the building,
  - b. Only two loading spaces,
  - c. More than 25% of the required parking to be located off-site
  - d. The gates in the front yard shall not exceed the height of the existing wall.
  - e. The fences on the north and south elevations shall not exceed 6 feet.
  - f. That no mature trees will be disturbed by the fencing.
  - g. Final plans be reviewed and approved by the Urban Conservator prior to issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness and a building permit.

### **ADJOURN**

As there were no other items for consideration by the Board, the meeting adjourned.

---

William L. Forwood  
Urban Conservator

---

John C. Senhauser  
Chairman

Date: \_\_\_\_\_